

Educators-in-Residence Spring 2021

German and US Definitions of Citizenship



Katharina Matro, Stone Ridge School
World History/US History, 9-12

Time Frame: 4-5 (50) minute lessons

Guiding Questions

What is a German? What is an American? How does one gain citizenship? How is citizenship defined?

Enduring Understanding

Different countries have different rules about who can and cannot obtain national citizenship. These rules are influenced by each country's history and shared set of values. As the global realities and as domestic and international values change, some argue that citizenship requirements have to keep up.

Learning Objectives

By the end of this lesson, students will have a clearer understanding of how difficult it is to define the concept of "citizenship". Students tend to think that the concept of "citizen" is pretty straightforward, not having thought much about the fact that the definition of "citizen" is a historical concept that has changed over time and has been shaped actively (and sometimes arbitrarily) by those in power.

Comparing two different approaches to citizenship and immigration in the case of Germany and the United States, will help students understand the "constructed" nature of citizenship. Students will learn to closely examine demographic statistics as well as to evaluate recent German and U.S. American primary source documents.

Standards and Benchmarks

HISTORY

D2.His.9.9-12. Analyze the relationship between historical sources and the secondary interpretations made from them.

D2.His.10.9-12. Detect possible limitations in various kinds of historical evidence and differing secondary interpretations.

D2.His.11.9-12. Critique the usefulness of historical sources for a specific historical inquiry based on their maker, date, place of origin, intended audience, and purpose.

D2.His.12.9-12. Use questions generated about multiple historical sources to pursue further inquiry and investigate additional sources.

D2.His.13.9-12. Critique the appropriateness of the historical sources used in a secondary interpretation.

D2.His.14.9-12. Analyze multiple and complex causes and effects of events in the past.

D2.His.15.9-12. Distinguish between long-term causes and triggering events in developing a historical argument.

D2.His.16.9-12. Integrate evidence from multiple relevant historical sources and interpretations into a reasoned argument about the past.

ANTHROPOLOGY

Develop through comparison awareness of human unity and cultural diversity, and of the connections among peoples from around the world.

Understand the reasons for and development of human and societal endeavors, such as small-scale societies and civilizations, across time and place.

Understand and appreciate cultural and social differences, and how human diversity is produced and shaped by local, national, regional, and global patterns.

Understand how one's local actions can have global consequences, and how global patterns and processes can affect seemingly unrelated local actions.

Become critically aware of ethnocentrism, its manifestations, and consequences in a world that is progressively interconnected.

Resources needed for this class:

- [German Citizenship Test](#) (2008) [Migration, Immigration Country, 6/8]
- U.S. Customs and Immigration Service's [Naturalization Test](#)
- [Hofstede's Dimensions of National Culture](#)*
- [Heiner Geißler, "Germany – an Immigration Country?"](#) [Migration, Immigration Country, 4/8]
- [Wladimir Kaminer, "Why I Still Haven't Applied for Naturalization"](#) (2000) [Migration, Immigration Country, 5/8]
- [Manifesto of the "Berlin Circle"](#) (May 11, 2016) [Migration, Immigration Country 8/8]
- [DeStatis](#) website
- [Migration Policy Institute](#) website
- [Giovanni Russonello, "What's Driving the Surge at the Southern Border?"](#)
- [House of European History, "The Human Cost of Fortress Europe."](#)*
- Mehdi Hasan, "[How it Feels to be a Muslim in Trump's America,](#)" *The New Statesman*, January 2018.
- [Manifesto](#) by the Alternative für Deutschland (2017).*
- Michael Anton, [US Citizenship shouldn't be a Birthright](#), *Washington Post* July 18, 2018.
- Pew Research Center, [Muslims and Islam: Key Findings in U.S. and Around the World](#) (2017)
- Pew Research Center, [In the U.S. and Western Europe, people say they accept Muslims, but opinions are divided on Islam](#) (2019)
- Pew Research Center, [American Muslims are concerned – but also satisfied with their lives](#) (2017)
- Digital whiteboard or shared slides or documents, or poster board with physical sticky notes.

*Denotes resources shared during CES Educator-in-Residence Programming.

Agenda

1. Do Now: Brainstorming national attributes and values
2. Debating Citizenship Requirements
3. Evaluating immigration statistics
4. Current Controversies on “Mass Migration”
5. Politics & Immigration
6. Exit Ticket

DO NOW: Direct students to make a bulleted list of “German” attributes and values and a bulleted list of “U.S. American” attributes and values. Then have them think about their lists using the following prompts:

- *Where do these values and attributes come from? How might they have evolved over time?*
- *Which of these values or attributes should make it into a set of official citizenship requirements?*
- *How would you measure whether a person conforms to or has attained these requirements?*

Have some volunteers share out.

Frame for students that this lesson will focus on the definition of citizenship as well as on who may be granted to live and work within the official boundaries of a given country.

Debating and analyzing citizenship tests:

Direct students to the U.S. Customs and Immigration Service's [Naturalization Test](#) and have them try to answer the question without looking at the answers in italics. Then direct them to the excerpt of the [German equivalent](#) of that test on the GHI website. Ask students to compare the questions asked in each test, discussing their thoughts with a partner. Students should note down their takeaways.

- *What are the values reflected in these tests?*
- *What is deemed important knowledge?*

Ask volunteers to share out their conclusions.

Option to expand the value discussion: How much should a “shared culture” be a part of a national citizenship definition?

Have students skim Hofstede's dimensions of “National Culture” [here](#). Then have them guess where both Germany and the U.S. fall on each of these six dimensions. Encourage them to discuss with a partner both what they're thinking but also why they categorize each national culture a certain way. Then have them look up the actual values for both countries [here](#). Have a whole group discussion about students' initial guesses and how those compared to the actual values. Ask students to jot down a quick reflection on the following prompt:

How important are shared values and a shared culture for a community of citizens?

Analyzing statistics:

Ask students to investigate Germany's and the United States' foreign born (and foreign) populations using the country's respective statistical offices' data. (The U.S. Census website is

hard to navigate, so direct students to the Migration Policy Institute website, which compiled its data using Census data.)

German Data	U.S. Data
DeStatis (German Statistical Office): <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Foreign Population by Land• Foreign Population over time• Naturalizations• Asylum Seekers	Migration Policy Institute Data : Ask students to compare foreign born population over time; then have them use the drop down menu on the right to compare the foreign born population across different states.

Also direct students to closely examine this [graphic](#) from *Statista* as well as this graph on [net migration](#) from *Our World in Numbers*. Remind them that both graphs depict migrants in absolute numbers and that for an international comparison to be meaningful, relative values might make more sense. The U.S. Population in 2021 is estimated at around 330.1 million ([Census](#)). Germany's population at around 83.1 million ([DeStatis](#)).

Ask students to collaborate in pairs and write a short paragraph comparing German and U.S. migration statistics. They should think about their [main takeaways](#) and also about how the statistics they examined might challenge their initial views on each country's immigration situation.

Recent Migration/Immigration Controversy [suggested for homework reading]

Before asking students to dive into some of the primary sources reacting to the topic of "mass migration," have them read the following background materials. [You may consider assigning this as homework in anticipation of the primary source lesson below.]

Students should read the following two texts:

- Giovanni Russonello, "What's Driving the Surge at the Southern Border?" *The New York Times* April 5, 2021, <https://www.nytimes.com/2021/04/05/us/politics/biden-immigration-crisis.html>, accessed May 14, 2021.
- House of European History, "The Human Cost of Fortress Europe," https://historia-europa.ep.eu/sites/default/files/Discover/EducatorsTeachers/ActivitiesForYourClassroom/migr-resource-2-en_0.pdf, accessed June 20, 2021.

After reading both texts, ask students to reflect on the following questions:

What is the difference between a "migrant" and a "refugee"? What pushes people to leave their homeland and come to the United States or to Europe (Germany)? What pulls them? Do you see differences on both continents? Do you think the people discussed in both articles want to become citizens of Germany or of the United States? Why or why not?

Evaluating the data using primary sources:

Divide the students into smaller groups and assign each group a document from the list below to read, annotate, and evaluate. Each group should designate a timekeeper/moderator and a scribe. Groups should use their assigned documents to design a short presentation (using slides, poster board, or just an oral presentation) addressing the following questions:

- *Who is the author of your assigned text? How does the author's context/role shape their view of citizenship?*
- *What do your group's assigned texts imply about the attributes, characteristics, and values ascribed to "Germans" and/or to "Americans"?*
- *Is there agreement about what the ideal citizen looks like?*
- *How might your group's assigned texts shed light on the demographic data that you looked at earlier? How do these texts help contextualize and/or complicate the story that the data we have already examined tells?*

Group 1: [Heiner Geißler, "Germany – an Immigration Country?"](#) (date?) [Migration, Immigration Country, 4/8] and [Wladimir Kaminer, "Why I Still Haven't Applied for Naturalization"](#) (2000) [Migration, Immigration Country, 5/8]

Group 2: [Thomas de Maizière, "A Leitkultur for Germany – What exactly does it mean?"](#) (2017) [Germanness 47] and [Manifesto of the "Berlin Circle"](#) (May 11, 2016) [Migration, Immigration Country 8/8] and [Manifesto](#) by the Alternative für Deutschland [AfD]: focus on the Preamble (p. 6) and Chapters 7 (p. 45) and Chapter 9 (p. 57); for a primer on the AfD refer to this [summary](#) from Deutsche Welle

Group 3: Mehdi Hasan, "[How it Feels to be a Muslim in Trump's America,](#)" *The New Statesman*, January 2018.

Group 4: Pew Research Center Studies on Muslims and Islam in the U.S. and Western Europe
 → [Muslims and Islam: Key Findings in U.S. and Around the World](#) (2017)
 → [In the U.S. and Western Europe, people say they accept Muslims, but opinions are divided on Islam](#) (2019)
 → [American Muslims are concerned – but also satisfied with their lives](#) (2017)

Group 5: → Michael Anton, [US Citizenship shouldn't be a Birthright](#), *Washington Post* July 18, 2018.
 → Mark Joseph Stern, "[Michael Anton's Op-Ed on Ending Birthright Citizenship Is Racist, Ahistorical Gobbledygook,](#)" *Slate.com*, July 19, 2018, accessed June 24, 2021.

Have the five groups share out their main findings with the rest of the class. After the presentations collect takeaways on the following question:

Who are American citizens? Who are German citizens? What does it take to feel like one? Who should get to decide what makes one?

Exit Ticket: Ask students to reflect on today's lesson, using the thinking routine below.

I used to think...

Now I think...

Students might share their responses on an interactive whiteboard, a shared document, or a physical posterboard/whiteboard using stickies.